INVESTIGATION OF SIMULATION METHODOLOGIES FOR ULTRA-HIGH–MOLECULAR-WEIGHT POLYETHYLENE

ARASH RAMEZANI & HENDRIK ROTHE
Helmut-Schmidt-University / University of the Federal Armed Forces Hamburg, Germany.

ABSTRACT
This work deals with numerical simulations of impact problems on fiber-based composite armor using the commercial finite-element-code ANSYS AUTODYN. Having presented some basic knowledge on the theory of numerical simulation in AUTODYN, two recently published approaches for modeling impact on the selected composite (Dyneema® HB26) are explained. Although both of them make use of a nonlinear-orthotropic material model implemented in the AUTODYN-code, they differ in the way how the highly inhomogeneous microstructure of HB26 is represented geometrically. Lässig chooses a fully homogeneous description, whereas Nguyen discretizes the composite into sublaminates, which are kinematically joined at the surfaces and breakable when a certain contact-stress is reached. In order to validate the two approaches, the response of HB26-samples impacted by handgun-projectiles was determined experimentally and compared to the corresponding numerical results. Unfortunately, a poor agreement between experimental and numerical results was found, which gave rise to the development of an alternative modeling approach. In doing so, the composite was subdivided into alternating layers of two different types. While the first type of layers was modeled with open-literature properties of UHMWPE-fibers, polymer-matrix-behavior was assigned to the second type. Having adjusted some of the parameters, good agreement between experiment and simulation was found with respect to residual velocity and depth of penetration for the considered impact situations.

Keywords: armor systems, fiber-reinforced plastics, optimization, simulation models.

1 INTRODUCTION
Ultra-high-molecular-weight polyethylenes (UHMW-PE) represent a modern composite material with high stiffness and strength. These polyethylene fibers belong to the group of thermoplastics and, combined with a suitable matrix material, ensure high ballistic protection. Due to the current turn to lightweight constructions, fiber composites are of great interest in research and industry. Among other things, there are efforts to use these in protective structures for civilian security vehicles.

The development was started in the early 1970s. At the beginning, the understanding was limited to a few different fibers. They provided a decent level of ballistic protection and to a greater extent when combined with a thermost resin and molded under heat and pressure. But at that time, there was practically no competition and no incentive for improvement.

The breakthrough came when high-molecular-weight polyethylenes were introduced in the mid-1980s and Polybenzobisoxazole (PBO) was introduced in the late 1990s. Fibers started moving out from bench-scale to full-scale production and customers started demanding lower weight and higher ballistic protection.

Besides, new technologies were developed to improve the protective characteristics of fiber-based composite armor structures. Ballistic fibers were combined into a (0, 90) network without going through the traditional fiber twist and weaving technology. It changed the entire dynamics of lightweight armor, and fiber-based composite structures have spread rapidly all over the world – used in peacekeeping and military missions.
In the future, conventional materials such as aluminium or steel will be increasingly replaced by fiber composites. Due to the reduction in weight with the same or better mechanical properties, a large field of activity in the protective sector opens up for the use of UHMW-PE.

In order to ensure the effectiveness of UHMW-PE, an in-depth understanding of the material behavior under impact is necessary. Therefore, investigations with regard to the behavior of different plate thicknesses in impact events are indispensable. A deep understanding of the different phenomena, such as processes during the penetration of a fiber-based composite armor or the different failure mechanisms, is important for this field of research.

This work will focus on composite armor structures consisting of several layers of UHMW-PE, a promising ballistic armor material due to its high specific strength and stiffness. The goal is to evaluate the ballistic efficiency of UHMW-PE composite with numerical simulations, promoting an effective development process. After a brief introduction and description of the different methods of space discretization in Section 3, there is a brief overview of ballistic tests to offer some basic knowledge of the subject, serving as a basis for the comparison of the simulation results. Details of ballistic trials on composite armor systems are presented in Section 4. Instead of running expensive trials, numerical simulations should identify vulnerabilities of structures. Contrary to the experimental result, numerical methods allow easy and comprehensive studying of all mechanical parameters. Modeling will also help to understand how the fiber-reinforced plastic armor schemes behave during impact and how the failure processes can be controlled to our advantage. The analysis with numerical simulations is described in Section 5. The paper ends with a concluding paragraph in Section 6.

2 STATE-OF-THE-ART
As shown in [1], the numerical modeling of composite materials under impact can be performed at a constituent level (i.e., explicit modeling of fibre and matrix elements, e.g., [2]), a meso-mechanical level (i.e., consolidated plies or fibre bundles, e.g., [3]), or macromechanically in which the composite laminate is represented as a continuum.

In Refs [4–7], a non-linear orthotropic continuum material model was developed and implemented in a commercial hydrocode (i.e., ANSYS® AUTODYN®) for application with aramid and carbon fiber composites under hypervelocity impact. The non-linear orthotropic material model includes orthotropic coupling of the material volumetric and deviatoric responses, a non-linear equation of state (EoS), orthotropic hardening, combined stress failure criteria and orthotropic energy-based softening. For more details refer to Ref. [8].

Lässig et al. [9] conducted extensive experimental characterization of Dyneema® HB26 UHMW-PE composite for application in the continuum non-linear orthotropic material model, and validated the derived material parameters through simulation of spherical projectile impacts at hypervelocity. The target geometry is homogenized. The projectile is an aluminum ball in simplified terms. However, homogenized target geometries with orthotropic material models are not able to reproduce different modes of failure. The results are valid for aluminum spherical-shaped projectiles in hypervelocity range only.

Nguyen et al. [10] evaluated and refined the modeling approach and material model parameter set developed in [9] for the simulation of impact events from 400 m/s to 6600 m/s. Across this velocity range, the sensitivity of the numerical output is driven by different aspects of the material model, e.g., the strength model in the ballistic regime and the equation of state (EoS) in the hypervelocity regime. Here, the target geometry is divided into sub-laminates joined by bonded contacts breakable through a combined tensile and shear stress failure criterion.
The models mentioned above are valid for blunt fragment-simulating projectiles (FSPs) from a velocity range of 400 to 6600 m/s. They show considerable shortcomings in simulating pointed projectiles and thick HB26-composites.

This paper will present an optimal solution of this problem with an enhanced model for UHMW-PE under impact loading. For the first time, composite armor structures consisting of several layers of fiber-reinforced plastics are simulated for all the current military threats.

3 METHODS OF SPACE DISCRETIZATION
To deal with problems involving the release of a large amount of energy over a very short period of time, e.g., explosions and impacts, there are three approaches: as the problems are highly non-linear and require information regarding material behavior at ultra-high loading rates which is generally not available, most of the work is experimental and thus may cause tremendous expenses. Analytical approaches are possible if the geometries involved are relatively simple and if the loading can be described through boundary conditions, initial conditions or a combination of the two. Numerical solutions are far more general in scope and remove any difficulties associated with geometry [11]. They apply an explicit method and use very small time steps for stable results.

For problems of dynamic fluid-structure interaction and impact, there typically is no single best numerical method which is applicable to all parts of a problem. Techniques to couple types of numerical solvers in a single simulation can allow the use of the most appropriate solver for each domain of the problem.

The goal of this paper is to evaluate a hydrocode, a computational tool for modeling the behavior of continuous media. In its purest sense, a hydrocode is a computer code for modeling fluid flow at all speeds [12]. For that reason, a structure will be split into a number of small elements. The elements are connected through their nodes (see Fig. 1).

The behavior (deflection) of the simple elements is well-known and may be calculated and analyzed using simple equations called shape functions. By applying coupling conditions between the elements at their nodes, the overall stiffness of the structure may be built up and the deflection/distortion of any node – and subsequently of the whole structure – can be calculated approximately [13].

Using a CAD-neutral environment that supports bidirectional, direct, and associative interfaces with CAD systems, the geometry can be optimized successively [14]. Therefore, several runs are necessary: from modeling to calculation to the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the model (see Fig. 2).

Bullet-resistant materials are usually tested by using a gun to fire a projectile from a set distance into the material in a set pattern. Levels of protection are based on the ability of the target to stop a specific type of projectile traveling at a specific speed. Further details are discussed in Ref. [1].

![Figure 1: Example grid.](image-url)
Ballistics is an essential component for the evaluation of our results. Here, terminal ballistics is the most important sub-field. It describes the interaction of a projectile with its target. Terminal ballistics is relevant for both small and large caliber projectiles. The task is to analyze and evaluate the impact and its various modes of action. This will provide information on the effect of the projectile and the extinction risk.

Given that a projectile strikes a target, compressive waves propagate into both the projectile and the target. Relief waves propagate inward from the lateral free surfaces of the penetrator, cross at the centerline, and generate a high tensile stress. If the impact was normal, we would have a two-dimensional stress state. If the impact was oblique, bending stresses will be generated in the penetrator. When the compressive wave reached the free surface of the target, it would rebound as a tensile wave. The target may fracture at this point. The projectile may change direction if it perforates (usually toward the normal of the target surface).

Because of the differences in target behavior based on the proximity of the distal surface, we must categorize targets into four broad groups. A semi-infinite target is one where there is no influence of distal boundary on penetration. A thick target is one in which the boundary influences penetration after the projectile is some distance into the target. An intermediate thickness target is a target where the boundaries exert influence throughout the impact. Finally, a thin target is one in which stress or deformation gradients are negligible throughout the thickness [15].

There are several methods by which a target will fail when subjected to an impact. The major variables are the target and penetrator material properties, the impact velocity, the projectile shape (especially the ogive), the geometry of the target supporting structure, and the dimensions of the projectile and target.

In order to develop a numerical model, a ballistic test program is necessary. The ballistic trials are thoroughly documented and analyzed – even fragments must be collected. They provide information about the used armor and the projectile behavior after fire, which must be consistent with the simulation results (see Fig. 3).
The ballistic tests are followed by computational modeling of the experimental set-up. Then, the experiment is reproduced using numerical simulations. Figure 1 shows a cross-section of the projectile and a CAD model. The geometry and observed response of the laminate to ballistic impact is approximately symmetric to the axis through the bullet impact point.

Numerical simulation of modern armor structures requires the selection of appropriate material models for the constituent materials and the derivation of suitable material model input data. The laminate system studied here is an UHMW-PE composite. Lead and copper are also required for the projectiles.

The projectile was divided into different parts – the jacket and the base – which have different properties and even different meshes. These elements have quadratic shape functions and nodes between the element edges. In this way, the computational accuracy, as well as the quality of curved model shapes increases. Using the same mesh density, the application of parabolic elements leads to a higher accuracy compared to linear elements (first-order elements).

The numerical analysis, material models, solver technologies, and meshing structures are based on [1].

5.1 Modelling

In Ref. [9], numerical simulations of 15 kg/m² Dyneema® HB26 panels impacted by 6 mm diameter aluminum spheres between 2052 m/s to 6591 m/s were shown to provide very good agreement with experimental measurements of the panel ballistic limit and residual velocities, see Fig. 4. The modeling approach and material parameter set from Ref. [9] were applied to simulate impact experiments at velocities in the ballistic regime (here considered as < 1000 m/s). In Fig. 4, the results of modeling impact of 20-mm FSPs against 10-mm thick Dyneema®
HB26 are shown. The model shows a significant under prediction of the ballistic limit, 236 m/s compared to 394 m/s.

5.2 Simulation results

Relatively newer numerical discretization methods, such as smoothed particle hydrodynamics (SPH), have been proposed that rectifies the issue of grid entanglement. The SPH method has shown good agreement with high velocity impact of metallic targets, better predictions of crack propagation in ceramics and fragmentation of composites under hypervelocity impact (HVI) compared to grid-based Lagrange and Euler methods. Although promising, SPH suffers from consistency and stability issues that lead to lower accuracy and instabilities under tensile perturbation. The latter makes it unsuitable for use with UHMW-PE composite under ballistic impact, because this material derives most of its resistance to penetration when it is loaded in tension. For these types of problems, the grid-based Lagrangian formulation still remains the most feasible for modeling UHMW-PE composite.

3D numerical simulations were performed of the full target and projectile, where both were meshed using eight-node hexahedral elements. The projectile was meshed with nine elements across the diameter. The target is composed of sub-laminates that are one element thick, separated by a small gap to satisfy the master-slave contact algorithm (external gap in AUTODYN®) and bonded together as previously discussed. The mesh size of the target is approximately equal to the projectile at the impact site. The mesh was then graded toward the edge, increasing in coarseness to reduce the computational load of the model. Since UHMW-PE composite has a very low coefficient of friction, force fit clamping provides little restraint.

High-speed video of ballistic impact tests typical showed the action of loosening and moving clamps upon impact. As such, no boundary conditions were imposed on the target. The FSP material was modeled as Steel S-7 from the AUTODYN® library described using a linear EoS
and the Johnson-Cook strength model [16]. The aluminum sphere was modeled using AL1100-O from the AUTODYN® library that uses a shock EoS and the Steinburg Guinan strength model [17]. The master-slave contact algorithm was used to detect contact between the target and projectile.

The sub-laminate model with shock EoS was applied to the aluminum sphere hypervelocity impact series and 20-mm FSP ballistic impact series presented in Fig. 4, the results of which are shown in Fig. 5. The sub-laminate model is shown to provide a significant improvement in predicting the experimental $V_{50}$ of 394 m/s for the FSP ballistic impacts (377 m/s) compared to the monolithic model (236 m/s).

The ballistic limit and residual velocity predicted with the sub-laminate model for the hypervelocity impact case are shown to be comparable with the original monolithic model. For conditions closer to the ballistic limit, the sub-laminate model is shown to predict increased target resistance (i.e., lower residual velocity). For higher overmatch conditions, there is some small variance between the two approaches.

In Fig. 6, a qualitative assessment of the bulge formation is made for the 10 mm panel impacted at 365 m/s (i.e., below the $V_{50}$) by a 20-mm FSP. Prediction of bulge development is important as it is characteristic of the material wave speed and is also a key measure in defence applications, particularly in personnel protection (i.e., vests and helmets). The sub-laminate model is shown to reproduce the characteristic pyramid bulge shape and drawing of material from the lateral edge. In comparison, the bulge prediction of the baseline model is poor, showing a conical shape with the projectile significantly behind the apex. In the baseline model, penetration occurs through premature through-thickness shear failure around the projectile rather than in-plane tension (membrane), which would allow the formation of a pyramidal bulge as the composite is carried along with the projectile. Furthermore, in the baseline model, the extremely small through-thickness tensile strength (1.07 MPa) in the bulk material leads to early spallation/delamination of the back face. This allows the material on the

![Figure 5: Comparison of the experimental results with the two numerical models for impact of 20 mm fragment simulating projectiles against 10 mm thick Dyneema HB26® at normal incidence (left), and impact of 6 mm diameter aluminium spheres against 15 kg/m² Dyneema® HB26 at normal incidence (right). Lambert-Jonas parameters (a, p, Vbl) are provided in the legend.](image)
target back face to fail and be accelerated ahead of the projectile. In the sub-laminate model, these two artifacts are addressed, and so a more representative bulge is formed.

5.3 Further validations

The material model developed in Refs [9] and [10] has some shortcomings regarding the simulation of handgun projectiles (see Fig. 7). The ballistic limit was significantly under
predicted. Evaluation of the result suggests that the failure mechanisms, which drive performance in the rear section of the target panel (i.e., membrane tension) were not adequately reproduced, suggesting an under-estimate of the material in-plane tensile performance.

A major difficulty in the numerical simulation of fiber composites under impact is the detection of failure processes between fiber and matrix elements as well as between the individual laminate layers (delamination). One promising approach is the use of ‘artificial’ inhomogeneities on the macroscale. Here, an alternative simulation model has been developed to overcome these difficulties. Using sub-laminates and inhomogeneities on the macroscale, the model does not match the real microstructure, but allows a more realistic description of the failure processes mentioned above.

Approaches based on the continuum or macroscale present a more practical alternative to solve typical engineering problems. However, the complexity of the constitutive equations and characterization tests necessary to describe an anisotropic material at a macro or continuum level increases significantly.

When considering the micromechanical properties of the orthotropic yield surface with a non-linear hardening description, a non-linear shock equation of state, and a three-dimensional failure criterion supplemented by a linear orthotropic softening description should be taken into account. It is important to consider all relevant mechanisms that occur during ballistic impact, as the quality of the numerical prediction capability strongly depends on a physically accurate description of contributing energy dissipation mechanisms. Therefore, a combination of ballistic experiments and numerical simulations is required. Predictive numerical tools can be extremely useful for enhancing our understanding of ballistic impact events. Models that are able to capture the key mechanical and thermodynamic processes can significantly improve our understanding of the phenomena by allowing time-resolved investigations of virtually every aspect of the impact event. Such high fidelity is immensely difficult, prohibitively expensive or near impossible to achieve with existing experimental measurement techniques.

The thermodynamic response of a material and its ability to carry tensile and shear loads (strength) is typically treated separately within hydrocodes such that the stress tensor can be decomposed into volumetric and deviatoric components. Since the mechanical properties of fiber-reinforced composites are anisotropic (at least at the meso- and macroscale level), the deviatoric and hydrostatic components are coupled. That is deviatoric strains will produce a volumetric dilation and hydrostatic pressure leads to non-uniform strains in the three principal directions.

The strength and failure model was investigated by modeling single elements under normal and shear stresses. It was found that under through-thickness shear stress, the element would fail prematurely below the specified through-thickness shear failure stress. It was found that if the through-thickness tensile strength was increased, failure in through-thickness shear was delayed. This evaluation study shows the importance of the strength, failure and erosion models for predicting performance in the ballistic regime.

Previous material models for fiber-reinforced plastics were adjusted and the concept has been extended to different calibers and projectile velocities. Composite armor plates between 5.5 and 16.2 mm were tested in several ballistic trials and high-speed videos were used to analyze the characteristics of the projectile – before and after the impact.

The simulation results with the modified model are shown in Fig. 8. The deformation of the projectile, e.g., 7.62×39 mm, is in good agreement with the experimental observation. Both delamination and fragmentation can be seen in the numerical simulation.
Compared to the homogeneous continuum model, fractures can be detected easily. Subsequently, the results of experiment and simulation in the case of perforation were compared with reference to the projectile residual velocity. Here, only minor differences were observed. It should be noted that an explicit modeling of the individual fibres is not an option, since the computational effort would go beyond the scope of modern server systems.

6 CONCLUSIONS

This work demonstrated how a small number of well-defined experiments can be used to develop, calibrate, and validate solver technologies used for simulating the impact of projectiles on complex armor systems and composite laminate structures.

Existing material models were optimized to reproduce ballistic tests. High-speed videos were used to analyze the characteristics of the projectile – before and after the impact. The simulation results demonstrate the successful use of the coupled multi-solver approach and new modeling techniques. The high level of correlation between the numerical results and the available experimental or observed data demonstrates that the coupled multi-solver approach is an accurate and effective analysis method.

A non-linear orthotropic continuum model was evaluated for UHMW-PE composite across a wide range of impact velocities. Although previously found to provide accurate results for hypervelocity impact of aluminum spheres, the existing model and dataset revealed a significant underestimation of the composite performance under impact conditions driven by through-thickness shear performance (ballistic impact of FSPs). The model was found to exhibit premature through thickness shear failure as a result of directional coupling in the modified Hashin-Tsai
failure criterion and the large discrepancy between through-thickness tensile and shear strength of UHME-PE composite. As a result, premature damage and failure was initiated in the through-thickness shear direction leading to decreased ballistic performance. By de-coupling through-thickness tensile failure from the failure criteria and discretizing the laminate into a nominal number of kinematically joined sub-laminates through the thickness, progresses in modeling the ballistic response of the panels was improved.

New concepts and models can be developed and easily tested with the help of modern hydrocodes. The initial design approach of the units and systems has to be as safe and optimal as possible. Therefore, most design concepts are analyzed on the computer.

FEM-based simulations are well-suited for this purpose. Here, a numerical model has been developed, which is capable of predicting the ballistic performance of UHMW-PE armor systems. Thus, estimates based on experience are being more and more replaced by software.

The gained experience is of prime importance for the development of modern armor. By applying the numerical model, a large number of potential armor schemes can be evaluated and the understanding of the interaction between laminate components under ballistic impact can be improved.

The most important steps during an FE analysis are the evaluation and interpretation of the outcomes followed by suitable modifications of the model. For that reason, ballistic trials are necessary to validate the simulation results. They are designed to obtain information about

- the velocity and trajectory of the projectile prior to impact,
- changes in configuration of projectile and target due to impact,
- masses, velocities, and trajectories of fragments generated by the impact process.

Ballistic trials can be used as the basis of an iterative optimization process. Numerical simulations are a valuable adjunct to the study of the behavior of metals subjected to high-velocity impact or intense impulsive loading. The combined use of computations, experiments and high-strain-rate material characterization has, in many cases, supplemented the data achievable by experiments alone at considerable savings in both cost and engineering man-hours.

REFERENCES


